Dear professors Boyd, Mandal, and Crutchfield,

I sent you the messages below last Friday, but so far, I have not received a response from any of you. I will appreciate it if I receive a reply from one of you. If one of you sent me a reply, and I have not received it, please resend.

Sincerely,
Neri Merhav

Quoting merhav@ee.technion.ac.il:

> P.S. I should further clarify that in my paper, the model under consideration induces a memoryless channel from the input bits to the output bits, yet the extended upper bound on the extracted work in section 4 (accounting for correlations) is valid in much greater generality: it holds whenever the current output bit statistically depends only on the past and present input bits (but not on past output bits), which virtually means full generality.
>
> BTW, the joint entropy difference upper bound is not always tighter than the individual entropy difference upper bound. In my setup, for instance, it is the other way around.
>
> Best regards,
> Neri
>
> Quoting merhav@ee.technion.ac.il:
>
>> Dear professors Boyd, Mandal, and Crutchfield,
>>
>> I am reading with interest your above paper, and I have a comment if I may: On page 2, left column, in the second to the last paragraph, you cite my recent paper [48], (which meanwhile has been published in JSTAT on June 30: http://iopscience.iop.org/1742-5468/2015/6/P06037/article), among several other works that "neglect correlations in the information-bearing components ...". It is rather imprecise to include my paper among those with such a property. In that paper, I am extending the findings of the Mandal-Jarzynski model (reference [43] in your paper) in a variety of directions, one of which allows *arbitrary* correlations among the incoming bits. In fact, one of my results in [48] (see section 4 therein) is essentially the same as your equation (4), which you refer to as one of your main results. Moreover, I assume there nothing about the joint distribution of a string of ℓ bits, not even stationarity, as you do (since I am not taking the limit of ℓ to infinity). Also, in the last section of [48], I am even extending the results to arbitrary *deterministic* input sequences, where the input entropy is replaced by its Lempel-Ziv complexity (a term that comes universal data compression theory). Yet another direction of extension, in the same paper, goes beyond the binary alphabet (section 6 therein) and allows any finite alphabet. Finally, I am also using generalized notions of entropy to bound the extracted work (section 5).
>>
>> I would appreciate it if you gentlemen read my paper slightly more carefully and make a more precise comparison with my work.
>>
>> Very truly yours,
>> Neri Merhav
>>
>>
>> ---
>> Prof. Neri Merhav | Telefax: +972-(4)-829-4737
>> The Irving Shepard Chair | Cell: +972-(54)-527-4737
>> Electrical Engineering Dept. | merhav@ee.technion.ac.il
>> Technion, Haifa 32000, Israel | http://webee.technion.ac.il/people/merhav/
>> ---